

## Audit and Assurance Committee Meeting

Date of Meeting	Thursday 3 December 2020
Paper Title	Internal Audit Report – Collaborative Training
Agenda Item	8
Paper Number	AAC3-D
Responsible Officer	Jim Godfrey, Finance & Resources Director
Status	Disclosable
Action	For discussion

### 1. Report Purpose

1.1. To consider the Internal Audit Report on Collaborative Training.

### 2. Recommendations

2.1. The Committee is invited to **discuss** the Internal Audit Report on Collaborative Training.

### 3. Internal Audit Progress Report

3.1. This report provides an overview of the progress that has been made in exploring opportunities for collaborative training.

### 4. Risk Analysis

4.1. The work of the Internal Auditor is informed by an assessment of risk. The prompt implementation of the actions, in response to the audit recommendations, will enable GCRB to reduce the risks relating to compliance with the Financial Memorandum.

### 5. Equalities Implications

5.1. There are no equalities implications as a result of the recommendation in this report.

### 6. Legal Implications

6.1. There are no specific legal implications arising from this report.

### 7. Resource Implications

7.1. The provision of internal audit is a necessary component of an organisation's overall governance arrangement with regard to both financial and other matters.

### 8. Strategic Plan Implications

8.1. Through the Regional Outcome Agreement and associated requirements, GCRB has to have effective governance arrangements, of which internal audit is part.

# Glasgow Colleges Regional Board

Collaborative Training

**Internal Audit Report No: 2020/04**

**Draft issued: 24 November 2020**

**Final issued: 24 November 2020**

**LEVEL OF ASSURANCE**

**Satisfactory**

# Contents

		Page No.
<b>Section 1</b>	<b>Management Summary</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Overall Level of Assurance</b> <span style="float: right;">1</span></li> <li>• <b>Risk Assessment</b> <span style="float: right;">1</span></li> <li>• <b>Background</b> <span style="float: right;">1</span></li> <li>• <b>Scope, Objectives and Overall Findings</b> <span style="float: right;">2</span></li> <li>• <b>Audit Approach</b> <span style="float: right;">2</span></li> <li>• <b>Summary of Main Findings</b> <span style="float: right;">3</span></li> <li>• <b>Acknowledgements</b> <span style="float: right;">3</span></li> </ul>	
<b>Section 2</b>	<b>Main Findings and Action Plan</b>	<b>4 - 7</b>

## Level of Assurance

In addition to the grading of individual recommendations in the action plan, audit findings are assessed and graded on an overall basis to denote the level of assurance that can be taken from the report. Risk and materiality levels are considered in the assessment and grading process as well as the general quality of the procedures in place.

Gradings are defined as follows:

<b>Good</b>	System meets control objectives.
<b>Satisfactory</b>	System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.
<b>Requires improvement</b>	System has weaknesses that could prevent it achieving control objectives.
<b>Unacceptable</b>	System cannot meet control objectives.

## Action Grades

<b>Priority 1</b>	Issue subjecting the organisation to material risk and which requires to be brought to the attention of management and the Audit and Assurance Committee.
<b>Priority 2</b>	Issue subjecting the organisation to significant risk and which should be addressed by management.
<b>Priority 3</b>	Matters subjecting the organisation to minor risk or which, if addressed, will enhance efficiency and effectiveness.

# Management Summary

## Overall Level of Assurance

**Satisfactory**

System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.

## Risk Assessment

This review focused on the controls in place to mitigate the following risks on the GCRB Strategic Risk Register:

Risk 2 – Effective working relationships are not developed/maintained with key partners due to a focus on short-term internal priorities.

Risk 9 – Working relationships within the Glasgow College Region (e.g. students, staff, board members) are ineffective and reduces our collective impact.

## Background

As part of the Internal Audit programme at the GCRB for 2019/20 we carried out a review of the Collaborative Training arrangements. The Annual Plan, agreed with management and the Audit and Assurance Committee in December 2018, identified this as an area where risk can arise and where Internal Audit can assist in providing assurances to the Executive Director and the Audit Committee that the related control environment is operating effectively, ensuring risk is maintained at an acceptable level.

The review focused on the actions undertaken by the Organisational Development (OD) Group to deliver its allocated actions detailed within the Regional Lead Plans, and as agreed by GCRB at its meeting on 18 June 2019. The regional OD Group consists of representatives from each of the Glasgow region colleges and was chaired by the Vice Principal, Human Resources and Organisational Development at Glasgow Kelvin College. The chair of the OD group was also the regional OD lead who had devised the agreed deliverables for the 2019/20 Regional Lead Plans.

As the identification and successful implementation of shared practices is a key strategic objective for GCRB the audit also reviewed whether the activities undertaken by the Group had identified any good practices for future shared service initiatives.

## Collaborative Training

### Scope, Objectives and Overall Findings

This audit assessed whether the 2019/20 GCRB Collaborative Training plan had been successfully delivered. The review also identified whether any areas of good practice in collaboration were apparent between the Colleges, which could aid delivery of future shared services initiatives across the region.

Objective	Findings			Actions already underway	
	1	2	3		
<b>The specific objectives of this audit were to obtain reasonable assurance the College has:</b>					
1. The agreed 2019/20 GCRB Collaborative Training plan has been successfully delivered	Satisfactory	0	0	1	
2. The delivery of the plan has identified areas of successful collaboration and benefits arising from the provision of shared services across the GCRB network	Satisfactory	0	0	0	✓
3. The benefits identified from the delivery of the Collaborative Training Plan are used to improve the delivery of future shared services initiatives across GCRB.	Satisfactory	0	0	1	
<b>Overall Level of Assurance</b>	<b>Satisfactory</b>	0	0	2	
		System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.			

### Audit Approach

As part of our audit we held discussions with College representatives on the regional OD group, and reviewed key documentation on the progress and delivery of activities of the Group during 2019/20 academic year.

## Collaborative Training

### Summary of Main Findings

#### Strengths

While the Covid-19 pandemic has adversely impacted on the delivery of the collaborative training plans the following elements have been successfully implemented:

- Collaborative networks have been established with the Human Resources (HR) leads now meeting on a weekly basis;
- Digital transformation has progressed with the launch of ClickView across the Glasgow region;
- Progress was also being reported against the innovation strand and the planning of the Design Thinking stage was underway;
- The regional OD Group has helped to foster good relations between OD professionals within each of the Colleges through the sharing of experiences and working practices; and
- GCRB have provided funding to support the Glasgow region Mental Health project to build capacity and resilience in each College for the provision of mental health services and the support made available for both staff and students.

#### Weaknesses

- There is currently no regional lead for the OD Group as the Vice Principal, Human Resources and Organisational Development at Glasgow Kelvin has now left their role;
- There has been no evaluation on the effectiveness of the successful delivery of some elements of the 2019/20 training plan; and
- There is an absence of clear and measurable criteria to assess the success of collaboration activities and initiatives within GCRB.

### Acknowledgements

We would like to take this opportunity to thank the staff who helped us during our audit.

# Main Findings and Action Plan

### **Objective 1: The agreed 2019/20 GCRB Collaborative Training plan has been successfully delivered.**

The Regional OD Group had been established to identify and develop opportunities for colleges to share opportunities for a more integrated approach to offering staff within GCRB an increased range of training. This group consists of representatives from the OD services within City of Glasgow College, Glasgow Kelvin College and Glasgow Clyde College. The Group was led by the Vice Principal, Human Resources and Organisational Development at Glasgow Kelvin college who was the regional lead for OD. Progress reports from the OD group are a standing agenda item at the bimonthly meetings of the GCG Sustainable Institutions Group.

The OD group had undertaken some work the previous year 2018/19 and had delivered the following training activities across all colleges;

- A Solution Focussed Conversation;
- An Introduction to Emotional Intelligence;
- Inclusive Practice with a Focus on Transitions and Autism; and
- “DISC” Profiling and the GROW Coaching Model.

Objectives set for the regional OD Group for 2019/20 included the delivery of:

- Wellbeing;
- Innovation;
- Digital Transformation; and
- Networking.

## Collaborative Training

### **Objective 1: The agreed 2019/20 GCRB Collaborative Training plan has been successfully delivered. (Continued)**

During the course of 2019/20 the OD Group developed a proposal for a leadership framework for use across all Colleges. However, while this proposal was made it was not accepted by the Principals Group.

The OD Group also developed an approach for collaborative networks for:

- HR;
- Learning and Development; and
- Student experience.

The initial plan was to pilot these networks with the aim to develop shared understanding and approaches in these areas. Despite the OD Group not formally meeting since November 2019. Progress has been made with the delivery of the 2019/20 agreed plans, the GCG Sustainable Institutions Group has been informed of progress in relation to:

- The collaborative networks with the HR Group meeting on a weekly basis; and
- Digital transformation with the launching of ClickView across the Glasgow region.

Progress was also being reported against the innovation strand with the planning of the Design Thinking stage.

In addition, as part of the Wellbeing initiatives, GCRB have provided funding to support the Glasgow region Mental Health project to build capacity and resilience in each college for the provision of mental health support. GCRB have engaged with the UK wide Charlie Waller Memorial Trust to provide bespoke training for both staff and students in mental health issues. In addition, there is also the potential for more resources to be made available for additional collaborative resources such as on-line counselling services and the Big White Wall.

Despite the absence of formal meetings of the Regional OD Group since November 2019 and the adverse impact of COVID-19 since March 2020, elements of the agreed annual plan have been delivered.



## Collaborative Training

Objective 1: The agreed 2019/20 GCRB Collaborative Training Plan has been successfully delivered. (Continued)					
Observation	Risks	Recommendation	Management Response		
Not all of the agreed activities from the 2019/20 Collaborative training Plan have been implemented. As the Chair of the Regional OD Group has now left, this role is now vacant, and no formal meetings of this group have taken place since November 2019.	Opportunities to share best practice and the benefits of collaborative work are not identified and delivered.	<b>R1</b> The Regional OD Group should be reconstituted, with a new Chair appointed to lead the Group and develop delivery plans to finish the outstanding elements from the agreed 2019/20 Collaborative Training Plan.	<p>Agreed. We will address this via a review of the Regional Lead roles and responsibilities.</p> <p><b>To be actioned by:</b> Executive Director</p> <p><b>No later than:</b> 28 February 2021</p>		
			<table border="1"> <tr> <td>Grade</td> <td><b>3</b></td> </tr> </table>	Grade	<b>3</b>
Grade	<b>3</b>				

## Collaborative Training

**Objective 2: The delivery of the plan has identified areas of successful collaboration and benefits arising from the provision of shared services across the GCRB network**

**Objective 3: The benefits identified from the delivery of the Collaborative Training plan are used to improve the delivery of future shared services initiatives across GCRB.**

Observation	Risks	Recommendation	Management Response		
As highlighted above, while elements of the agreed Collaborative Training plans have been delivered there has been no formal assessment undertaken to measure the success of these initiatives. The delivery of the Mental Health Project is an excellent example of the benefits which can be achieved through effective collaborative activity. However, it is difficult to assess whether these activities have identified any benefits as there is no clear criteria in place to measure the success or otherwise of these collaboration activities and initiatives. Therefore, we are unable to accurately assess the effectiveness of these measures introduced.	Opportunities to share best practice and the benefits of collaborative work are not identified and delivered.	<b>R2</b> The reconstituted Regional OD Group, as part of any future planning activity, should undertake an evaluation of the elements of the 2019/20 training plans that have been delivered in order to assess the effectiveness of the initiatives assessed and to identify any further work required in these areas. To measure the success of the collaborative initiatives and plans delivered by the Regional OD Group clear and measurable criteria should be established. These should be used to measure the success of the delivered plans for collaborative training and identify opportunities to improve the delivery of future shared serviced initiatives across GCRB.	<p>Agreed. This recommendation will be progressed by the Regional Lead for OD (under the guidance of the GCRB Executive Director).</p> <p><b>To be actioned by:</b> GCRB Executive Director</p> <p><b>No later than:</b> 31 July 2021</p>		
			<table border="1"> <tr> <td><b>Grade</b></td> <td><b>3</b></td> </tr> </table>	<b>Grade</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Grade</b>	<b>3</b>				

### **Aberdeen**

45 Queen's Road  
Aberdeen  
AB15 4ZN

**T:** 01224 322100

### **Dundee**

The Vision Building  
20 Greenmarket  
Dundee  
DD1 4QB

**T:** 01382 200055

### **Edinburgh**

Ground Floor  
11-15 Thistle Street  
Edinburgh  
EH2 1DF

**T:** 0131 226 0200

### **Glasgow**

100 West George Street  
Glasgow  
G2 1PP

**T:** 0141 471 9870

MHA Henderson Loggie is a trading name of Henderson Loggie LLP, which is a limited liability partnership registered in Scotland with registered number SO301630 and is a member of MHA, an independent member of Baker Tilly International Ltd, the members of which are separate and independent legal entities

© 2019 MHA Henderson Loggie



[hlca.co.uk](http://hlca.co.uk) | [info@hlca.co.uk](mailto:info@hlca.co.uk)